To cut or not to cut, that is the question!

Lesson Overview
In this lesson, students will explore different perspectives associated with forest harvesting in Duck Mountain provincial park in Manitoba. They will assume the position of a stakeholder and defend whether or not logging should be allowed in provincial parks.

Grade Level
Grade 10

Time Required
Two 60 minute classes

Curriculum Connection (Province/Territory and course)
Manitoba; Geographic Issues of the 21st Century

Additional Resources, Materials and Equipment Required
- Chart paper and markers, or a blackboard/whiteboard
- Computer with access to the internet and a projector
- Appendix A: Making an Argument (attached)

Main Objective
Students will develop an argument concerning forest harvesting in a provincial park. They will support their argument with research and facts and present it to the class.

Learning Outcomes
By the end of the lesson, students will be able to:
- research and defend a point of view on an issue;
- develop an argument and support it with facts;
- prepare a counterargument;
- explore and examine different perspectives on the subject of logging within provincial parks.

As part of the Manitoba lesson, students will learn that there is only one provincial park in Manitoba, Duck Mountain Provincial Park, which includes a Provincial Forest where commercial logging is allowed.
The Lesson

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Activity</th>
<th>Student Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ask the class what they know about forest harvesting operations. Record the</td>
<td>Contribute to the group discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information on chart paper or on the blackboard/whiteboard.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Show students the video clip entitled <em>Friesen Bros. Logging (length: 9:58)</em>.</td>
<td>Watch the video and take notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruct them to take notes on the type of activity taking place, the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>equipment being used etc...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pose a hypothetical issue: part of a local provincial park is about to be</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commercially logged. What are the benefits and challenges of logging in a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provincial park?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divide the class into four groups. Each group must develop and present a</td>
<td>Assemble into groups and start discussing what the argument might be.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>convincing argument that explains why logging <em>should</em> or <em>should not</em> occur</td>
<td>Write a convincing paper that will be presented to a judge (teacher) and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the park? Remind the groups that they need to include facts to support their</td>
<td>evaluated based on the strength of the arguments and factual evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>argument.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groups:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Conservation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o First Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Logging Industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lesson Development</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hand out Appendix A: Making an Argument. Review the information and inform</td>
<td>Work in groups to develop and prepare arguments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students that it should be used as a guide for the activity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assist students as they write and prepare their arguments.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusion</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listen to the presentations. Moderate and evaluate throughout the presentations.</td>
<td>Present arguments to the class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ask several concluding questions:</td>
<td>Respond to the questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Which group had the most effective argument? What</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
made it effective?
- What group had the most convincing counterargument? Why?
- Whose argument would most likely change peoples’ minds about logging in provincial parks? Why?

Lesson Extension
- Ask peer groups to evaluate and assess the arguments rather than the teacher.
- Conduct research into logging in provincial parks in other Canadian provinces.
- Visit a local pulp and paper mill:
  Tolko Manitoba PO Box 1590
  The Pas MB, R9A 1L4
  204-623-7411/204-623-5891

  Tembec Paper Group – Pine Falls Operation
  P.O. Box 10
  Pine Falls, Manitoba R0E 1M0
  204-367-5353/204-367-2442

  Louisiana Pacific Canada Ltd.
  439 Westwood Road
  Swan River, MB R0L 1Z0
  204-734-4102

Assessment of Student Learning
These questions can be used to evaluate the presentations:
- Did the group have an identifiable thesis?
- Did the group adequately support their claim? Were the statistics accurate? Have they been used fairly?
- Were any of the groups’ claims and assumptions questionable?
- Did the group consider opposing arguments and refute them persuasively?

Further Reading
- Forest Products Association of Canada
  www.fpac.ca
  www.borealforestagreement.com
- Canadian Geographic/FPAC Boreal Forest poster-map
- Canadian Atlas Online Future of Forestry theme
  www.canadiangeographic.ca/atlas
• Canadian Geographic/FPAC Boreal Forest interactive map
  www.canadiangeographic.ca/boreal

• Logging in Canada’s Provincial Parks (1998)
  http://www.sciencelives.com/logging.html

• Canadian Forests
  http://www.canadian-forests.com/

**Link to Canadian National Standards for Geography**

**Essential Element #5: Environment and Society**

• World patterns of resource distribution and utilization
• Use and sustainability of resources
• Environmental issues (e.g. global warming, loss of biodiversity, deforestation, ozone depletion, air pollution, water pollution, acid precipitation, disposal of solid waste)

**Geographic Skill #1: Asking Geographic Information**

• Ask geographic questions: Plan and organize a geographic research project. (eg. Specify a problem, pose a research question or hypothesis and identify data sources)

**Geographic Skill #2: Acquiring Geographic Information**

• Locate and gather geographic information from a variety of primary and secondary resources.
• Systematically assess the value and use of geographic information.

**Geographic Skill #3: Organizing Geographic Information**

• Use a variety of media to develop and organize integrated summaries of geographic information.

**Geographic Skill #4: Analyzing Geographic Information**

• Use the processes of analysis, synthesis, evaluation and explanation to interpret geographic information from a variety of sources.

**Geographic Skill #5: Answering Geographic Questions**

• Formulate valid generalizations from the results of various kinds of geographic inquiry.
• Evaluate the answers to geographic questions.
Appendix A: Making an Argument

Making an argument—expressing a point of view on a subject and supporting it with evidence—is a common task assigned in school.

Teachers may call on you to examine an issue and prepare an argument to defend it, refute it, or offer some new view of your own. In writing assignments, you will almost always need to do more than just summarize information that you have gathered or regurgitate facts that have been discussed in class. You will need to develop a point of view or interpretation of that material and provide evidence for your position.

Making a claim

What is an argument? In academic writing, an argument is usually a main idea, often called a "claim" or "thesis statement," backed up with evidence that supports the idea. In most cases, you will need to make some sort of claim and use evidence to support it. When beginning to write a paper, ask yourself, "What is my point?".

Evidence

Do not stop with having a point. You have to back up your point with evidence. The strength of your evidence, and your use of it, can make or break your argument.

Be consistent with your evidence. If you start a paragraph or section with a statement like "Logging in provincial parks is beneficial to all Manitobans", you should follow it with clear reasons why all Manitobans would benefit.

Counterargument

One way to strengthen your argument and show that you have a deep understanding of the issue you are discussing is to anticipate and address counterarguments or objections. By considering what someone who disagrees with your position might have to say about your argument, you show that you have thought things through, and you dispose of some of the reasons your audience might have for not accepting your argument. Using our topic of logging in provincial parks as an example, to make the most effective argument possible, you should consider the other side of the coin, people who are against it, and prepare a counterargument.

You can generate counterarguments by asking yourself how someone who disagrees with you might respond to each of the points you’ve made or your position as a whole. Be sure that your reply is consistent with your original argument. If your position changes as you develop as counterargument, you will need to go back and revise your original argument accordingly.